# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF ARKANSAS WESTERN DIVISION

In re: : MDL Docket No. 4:03CV01507-BRW

4:06CV00299-BRW

PREMPRO PRODUCTS LIABILITY

LITIGATION

:

SONDRA WELCH : PLAINTIFF

:

v.

:

WYETH, INC., et al. : DEFENDANTS

### **ORDER**

The parties submitted their witness designations, counter-designations, and objections for review. Below are the rulings on the parties' objections to those deposition designations:

# Michael Dey -- November 3, 2005

Defendants' objection to page 135, lines 1 through 9 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 135, lines 10 through 12 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 135, lines 13<sup>1</sup> through 15 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 230, line 23 through page 231, line 7 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 238, lines 15 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 240, lines 7 through 17 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 474, lines 8 through 12 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 752, line 6 through page 754, line 3 is OVERRULED.

## Michael Dey -- January 1, 2007

Defendants' objection to page 33, line 18 through page 35, line 8 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 36, lines 3 through 21 is OVERRULED.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Continued from line 12.

# Michael Dey -- October 19, 2009

Defendants' objection to page 32, lines 10 through 11 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 33, lines 7 through 24 is SUSTAINED.

### Pam Cobb -- June 23, 2006

Plaintiff's objection to page 308, line 18 through page 309, line 4 is OVERRULED. Plaintiff's objection to page 310, lines 7 through 18 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 316, line 9 through page 317, line 5 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 318, line 17 through page 319, line 12 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 319, line 22 through page 320, line 9 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 384, lines 6 through 11 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 499, line 3 through page 500, line 12 is OVERRULED.

# Gerald Fisher -- November 22, 2004

Plaintiff's objection to page 25, line 20 through page 26, line 18 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 31, line 18 through page 32, line 15 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 60, line 11 through page 61, line 10 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 337, line 16 through page 337, line 22 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 338, line 10 through page 339, line 17 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 339, line 19 through page 340, line 8 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 341, lines 4 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 346, line 4 through page 347, line 16 is OVERRULED.

### Harold Marder -- January 17, 2006

Plaintiff's objection to page 26, lines 5 through 18 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 71, lines 9 through 21 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 71, line 22 through page 72, line 11 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 72, lines 12 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 31, line 11 through page 32, line 17 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 32, line 18 through page 33, line 1 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 182, line 10 through page 186, line 13 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 190, line 11 through page 191, line 13 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 205, line 3 through page 205, line 13 is OVERRULED.

### Marc Dietch October 26-27, 2005

Defendants' objection to page 402, lines 14 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 620, lines 5 through 13 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 695, lines 19 through 24 is OVERRULED.

### Marc Dietch January 18, 2007

Plaintiff's objection to page 7, line 16 through page 9, line 9 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 9, lines 14 through 24 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 10, line 2 through page 11, line 3 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 13, line 6 through page 15, line 4 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 17, lines 10 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 17, lines 16 through 18 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 43, lines 3 through page 14 is OVERRULED.

### Marc Dietch April 2-3, 2012

Defendants' objection to page 1081, line 13 through page 1082, line 6 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 1083, lines 8 through 14 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 1095, line 14 through page 1096, line 2 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 1322, lines 6 through 12 is OVERRULED.

# Bernard Poussot January 23, 2007

Defendants' objection to page 19, lines 17 through 19 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 20, lines 2 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 69, line 20 through page 70, line 6 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 21, lines 21 through 25 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 22, line 25 through page 23, line 5 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 23, line 6 through page 24, line 19 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 24, lines 20 through 23 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 31, lines 4 through 5 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 32, line 16 through page 33, line 8 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 34, lines 12 through 21 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 34, line 22 through page 35, line 5 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 35, lines 6 through 11 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 36, line 16 through page 37, line 8 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 38, line 18 through page 39, line 15 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 40, lines 12 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 40, line 21 through page 41, line 14 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 41, line 16 through page 42, line 7 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 42, lines 8 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 49 lines 2 through 13 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 50, line 24 through page 51, line 24 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 52, lines 1 through 6 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 52, line 7 through part of line 8 is SUSTAINED.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Ending at the word "that."

Defendants' objection to page 57, lines 1 through 3 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 60, lines 3 through 5 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 60, lines 6 through 10 and lines 15-17 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 61, lines 10 through 17 is SUSTAINED.

## Graham Colditz -- December, 2006 Deposition

Defendants' objection to page 35, lines 11 through page 37, line 22 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 56, line 14 through page 57, line 12 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 84, line 10 through page 86, line 3 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 91, lines 9 through 20 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 92, line 11 through page 93, line 1 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 93, lines 2 through 7 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 93, line 10 through page 94, line 4 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 93, line 13 through page 95, line 20 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 95, line 23 through page 96, line 13 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 99, line 19 through page 100, line 6 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 101, line 19 through page 102, line 12 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 102, line 13 through page 103, line 4 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 103, line 21 through page 104, line 9 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 215, lines 3 through 16 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 233, line 12 through page 234, line 21 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 395, lines 6 through 21 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 807, line 9 through 808, line 21 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 809, lines 1 through 7 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 809, line 11 through page 810, line 11 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 811, line 22 through page 812, line 12 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 994, line 16 through page 996, line 4 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 1007, lines 7 through 22 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 1008, line 1 through page 109, line 2 is SUSTAINED.

# James Pickar, February 2, 2010

Defendants' objection to page 53, line 22 through page 54, line 6 is SUSTAINED.

## James Pickar, August 3, 2010

Defendants' objection to page 16, lines 2 through 4 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 22, lines 8 through 14 is OVERRULED.

Page 23 line 2 -- "that's not actually accurate, because" may be redacted.

Defendants' objection to page 33, line 24 through page 34, line 7 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 35, line 9 through page 36, line 7 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 43, lines 11 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 48, lines 9 through 17 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 49, lines 7 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Defendant's objection to PX10556C is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 51, line 8 through page 55, line 13 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 55, lines 14 through 20 is OVERRULED.

## James Pickar, September 18, 2009

Defendants' objection to page 74, lines 5 through 12 is SUSTAINED.

### James Pickar, August 4, 2010

Defendants' objection to page 82, line 25 through page 83, line 17 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to PX 1206 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 83, lines 18 through 25 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 30, lines 9 through 13 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 31, lines 22 through 25 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to PX ML 1918 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 72, line 20 through page 73 line 4 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 73, lines 19 through 24 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 76, line 2 through page 77 line 6 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 134, lines 9 through 16 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 134, line 20 through page 135 line 11 is OVERRULED.

# James Pickar, August 3, 2010

Plaintiff's objection to page 58, lines 19 through 25 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to PX 980B is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 60, line 22 through page 61, line 14 is SUSTAINED.

## James Pickar, February 3, 2010

Plaintiff's objection to page 94, lines 3 through 21 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 111, lines 12 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 110, lines 1 through 12 is OVERRULED.

### Fernando Bueso, July 27 and August 8, 2012

Plaintiff's objection to page 34, lines 17 through 18 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 37, line 21 through page 38, line 3 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 44, line 13 through page 45, line 6 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 46, line 17 through page 47, line 5 and line 22 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 48, line 21 through page 49, line 8 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 49, line 14 through page 50, line 6 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 54, line 21 through page 55, line 8 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 55, lines 15 through 18 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 64, lines 8 through 17 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 67, line 20 through page 68, line 5 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 68, line 21 through page 69, line 3 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 69, line 14 through page 70, line 10 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 71, lines 7 through 16 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 75, lines 7 through 14 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 78, line 8 through page 79, line 11 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 81, line 7 through page 82, line 6 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 84, line 3 through page 85, line 19 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 88, line 12 through page 89, line 11 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 93, lines 5 though 10 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 98, lines 14 through 23 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 99, lines 5 through 11 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 104, line 14 through page 105, line 4 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 105, line 6 through page 106, line 8 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 107, lines 5 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 110, lines 19 through 23 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 111, line 8 through page 113, line 14 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 118, line 11 through page 120, line 5 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 123, line 23 through page 135, line 8 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 125, lines 9 through 21 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 132, lines 5 through 10 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 134, line 19 through page 135, line 3 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 135, lines 4 through 22 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 154, line 1 through page 155, line 6 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 164, lines 17 through 19 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 165, lines 5 through 9 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 166, lines 6 through 8 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 167, lines 1 through 13 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 169, lines 10 through 17 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 170, line 23 through page 171, line 7 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 172, line 14 through page 173, line 6 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 176, lines 1 through 11 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 177, line 3 through page 178, line 5 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 178, line 15 through page 180, line 8 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 180, line 14 through page 181, line 7 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 181, lines 14 through 19 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 189, line 1 through page 190, line 4 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 190, lines 15 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 191, line 4 through page 193, line 12 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 195, lines 1 through 6 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 195, line 18 through page 196, line 1 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 196, line 18 through page 198, line 9 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 205, lines 17 through 21 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 208, line 21 through page 210, line 18 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 210, lines 19 through 23 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 218, line 17 though page 223, line 15 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 225, line 2 through page 227, line 14 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 236, lines 16 through 23 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 241, line 16 through page 242, line 22 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 243, lines 9 through 11 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 245, line 12 through page 246, line 23 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 247, lines 11 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 248, line 8 through page 250, line 23 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 252, lines 14 through 17 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 255, line 1 through page 256, line 21 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 259, lines 8 through 19 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 260, line 13 through page 261, line 14 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 261, line 20 through page 262, line 16 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 263, lines 2 through 13 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 263, lines 19 through 23 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 393, lines 19 through 22 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 397, line 23 through page 397, line 5 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 400, lines 8 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 293, lines 10 through 17 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 243, lines 9 through 11 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 423, lines 21 through 22 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 426, lines 2 through 12 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 427, lines 2 through 12 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 427, line 20 through page 428, line 3 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 428, lines 8 through 10 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 429, lines 8 through 9 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 430 lines 20 through 22 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 431, lines 7 through 9 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 431, lines 15 through 16 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 433, line 6 through page 434, line 7 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 435, lines 2 through 7 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 436, lines 1 through 21 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 438, lines 4 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 441, line 3 through page 443, line 13 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 56, lines 19 through 23 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 80, line 11 through page 81, line 6 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 135, lines 4 through 22 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 147, line 14 through page 148, line 1 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 174, lines 1 though 14 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 451, line 17 through page 454, line 5 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 454, lines 8 through 10 is OVERRULED.

### Justin Victoria, February 9, 2010

Defendants' objection to page 68, lines 10 through 18 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 15, line 19 through page 16, line 6 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to Defendants' "Federal Food Drug & Cosmetic Act" Slide is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 16, lines 18 through 25 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to Defendants' "Pivotal Trial Results" Slide is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 38, lines 4 through 11 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to Defendants' "Literature Submission" Slide is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 43, lines 15 through 21 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 44, line 17 through page 47, line 8 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to Defendants' "Victoria -- Regulatory Affairs" Slide is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 61, line 4 and page 62, line 21 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 65, lines 20 through 21 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 72, line 1 through page 73, line 9 is OVERRULED.

Defendant's objection to PX 41 is SUSTAINED, based on the testimony being excluded.

Defendants' objection to page 74, line 4 through page 75, line 2 is SUSTAINED.

Defendant's objection to PX 8019 is SUSTAINED, based on the testimony being excluded.

Defendants' objection to page 78, line 10 through page 79, line 5 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 79, line 6 through page 81 line 18 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to PX 135 is SUSTAINED, based on the testimony being excluded.

Defendants' objection to page 81, line 19 through page 82 line 15 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to PX 962 is SUSTAINED, based on the testimony being excluded.

Defendants' objection to page 82, line 16 through page 83 line 23 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 83, lines 7 through 9 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 85, line 10 through page 87 line 17 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to PX 289R is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 94, line 5 through page 97, line 4 is OVERRULED.

## Justin Victoria, January 22, 2007

Defendants' objection to page 12, line 13 through page 13, line 24 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 36, lines 7 through 12 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 37, lines 2 through 6 is OVERRULED.

# Michael Schoenfeld, August 3, 2007

Plaintiff's objection to page 168, line 20 through page 169, line 21 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 170, line 2 through page 171, line 10 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 171, line 25 through page 172, line 12 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 177, line 25 through page 178, line 8 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to Slide 9 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 190, line 24 through page 191, line 3 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 194, lines 2 through 8 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 212, line 21 through page 213, line 9 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 222, lines 13 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 246, lines 20 through 24 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 247, lines 8 through 22 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 45, lines 10 through 13 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 46, lines 24 through 25 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 47, lines 21 through 22 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 48, line 2 through page 49, line 20 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 248, lines 24 through 25 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 249, line 22 through page 250, line 1 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 250, lines 2 through 23 is OVERRULED.

### Sondra Welch, April 2, 2009

Plaintiff's objection to page 47, line 10 through page 48, line 14 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 47, lines 10 through 13 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 49, line 22 through page 51, line 24 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 74, lines 12 through 22 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 78, lines 10 through 14 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 78, line 24 through page 80, line 4 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 80, line 16 through page 81, line 6 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 86, lines 6 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 89, lines 11 through 22 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 90, line 23 through page 92, line 20 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 101, lines 9 through 25 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 124, line 4 through page 129, line 9 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 171, lines 16 through 22 is SUSTAINED.

## Fred Lyles, June 21, 2012

Plaintiff's objection to page 14, line 17 through page 15, line 8 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 44, lines 9 through 12 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 59, lines 11 through 22 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 63, line 20 through page 64, line 6 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 32, line 15 through page 34, line 9 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 34, lines 10 through 18 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 70, lines 11 through 16 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 70, lines 17 through 23 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 72, line 2 through page 73, line 4 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 73, line 24 through page 74, line 14 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 75, lines 3 through 6 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 75, line 7 through page 76, line 17 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 78, lines 21 through 24 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 79, line 23 through page 80, line 7 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 83, lines 8 through 12 is SUSTAINED.

# Gregory Beckner, July 18, 2012

Plaintiff's objection to page 17, line 4 through page 18, line 3 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 22, line 21 through page 25, line 1 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 26, lines 4 through 21 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 44, line 14 through page 46, line 14 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 47, lines 5 through 7 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 88, line 5 through page 89, line 11 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 124, line 22 through page 125, line 3 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 127, lines 16 through 19 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 128, line 24 through page 129, line 22 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 140, line 24 through page 141, line 11 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 141, lines 13 through 19 is OVERRULED.<sup>3</sup>

Defendants' objection to page 147, lines 10 through 19 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 148, lines 6 through 9 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 154, lines 15 through 23 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 155, lines 6 through 13 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 156, lines 12 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 157, line 15 through page 158, line 7 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 159, lines 8 through 14 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 160, line 9 through page 162, line 23 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 163, lines 1 through 3 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 163, lines 7 through 13 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 164, lines 1 through 7 is OVERRULED.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Plaintiff redacted the reference to Pfizer.

Plaintiff's objection to page 164, lines 10 through 16 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 167, lines 2 through 19 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 194, line 24 through page 195, line 18 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 197, line 3 through page 198, line 9 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 202, lines 17 through 24 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 203, lines 2 through 13 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 204, line 7 through page 206, line 19 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 210, line 5 through page 211, line 4 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 214, lines 3 through 12 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 214, line 20 through page 215, line 12 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 215, line 20 through page 216, line 6 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 222, line 4 through page 223, line 8 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 224, lines 11 through 24 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 226, line 3 through page 228, line 1 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 228, lines 13 through 24 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 229, lines 1 through 6 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 236, line 14 through page 237, line 11 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 238, lines 4 through 14 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 239, lines 3 through 6 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 240, line 21 through page 242, line 6 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 244, lines 17 through page 245, line 10 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 254, line 6 through page 255, line 19 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 255, line 21 through page 256, line 22 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 322, lines 11 through 15 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 264, line 15 through page 265, line 3 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 268, line 7 through page 270, line 10 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 270, line 12 through page 271, line 11 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 271, line 23 through page 273, line 13 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 272, lines 15 through 23 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 273, lines 18 through 24 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 274, lines 6 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 274, line 24 through page 275 line 4 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 275, line 14 through page 276 line 23 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 276, line 24 through page 277 line 2 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 277, line 3 through page 278 line 13 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 277, lines 20 through 24 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 281, line 9 through page 283, line 10 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 283, line 24 through page 284, line 10 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 284, line 11 through page 285, line 5 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 286, lines 1 through 8 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 298, lines 8 through 19 is SUSTAINED.

Defendants' objection to page 300, line 7 through page 309, line 9 is SUSTAINED without prejudice.

Defendants' objection to page 310, lines 10 through 14 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 312, lines 6 through 24 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 314, lines 18 through page 315, line 3 is OVERRULED.

Defendants' objection to page 319, lines 4 through 21 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 59, lines 9 through 16 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 70, lines 3 through 16 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 82, lines 14 through 19 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 86, lines 21 through page 87, line 1 is OVERRULED.

## Case 4:06-cv-00299-BRW Document 299 Filed 08/29/12 Page 18 of 18

Plaintiff's objection to page 91, line 24 through page 92, line 1 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 100, lines 1 through 13 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 103, lines 12 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 109, lines 7 through 15 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 110, line 8 through page 111, line 11 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 133, lines 6 through 11 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 134, lines 15 through 17 is SUSTAINED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 137, line 13 through page 138, line 20 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 341, lines 14 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 344, lines 16 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 348, lines 16 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 353, lines 11 through 20 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 354, lines 4 through 22 is OVERRULED.

Plaintiff's objection to page 359, line 17 through page 360, line 7 is OVERRULED.

IT IS SO ORDERED this 29th day of August, 2012.

/s/ Billy Roy Wilson
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE